



**PROJECT NAME: EXPANDING BEQUAL BENCHMARKING TOOL AND
COMMUNITY OF PRACTICE FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE IN VOCATIONAL
EDUCATION AND TRAINING (BEQUAL +)**

Work Package 2: Initial Study

COMMON COMPARATIVE REPORT

1. Objectives of the study

Based on information provided by the partners from Bulgaria, Turkey and Italy this report summarises the structure, content, and approaches for quality assurance in VET systems across the partner countries to provide an overview of the similarities, contrasts, and trends at national level that have to be taken into account in process of adaptation of the BEQUAL benchmarking tool. More specifically, the aim of the comparative study is:

- to explore the **characteristics of VET systems** in the importing countries and to outline the main features that should be taken into account in process of adaptation of products
- to examine and compare the **existing approaches for quality assurance** in participating countries
- to study the **transition from CQAF¹ to EQAVET²**; to assess the progress of the importing countries in linking their quality assurance arrangements to EQAVET
- to assess **mismatches, shortages and gaps** in quality assurance in importing countries
- to consider the **issues in adaptation of project products** to identified countries specifics and to EQAVET

¹ Common Quality Assurance Framework.

² European Quality Assurance Reference Framework for VET.

2. Institutions in VET system as target audience for BEQUAL benchmarking tool

BULGARIA	TURKEY	ITALY
<p>- Vocational schools - admission to is possible after completion of 6th grade; duration of education is up to 4 years; they provide vocational training for acquisition of first and second degree of qualification, or qualification on part of a profession;</p> <p>- Vocational secondary schools - provide training for acquiring of second degree of professional qualification (with duration of 4 years), or third degree of qualification (duration of five or six years); admission is possible after completion of primary education or 7th grade;</p> <p>- Vocational colleges - provide vocational training after completed secondary education; duration of training is up to 2 years;</p> <p>- Art schools and sports schools - provide vocational education for acquiring third degree of professional qualification; duration of training is up to 4; admission is possible after completion of</p>	<p>- Vocational High Schools – duration of education is 3 years (4 years for Anatolian Vocational High Schools including one year in a preparatory class in foreign language);</p> <p>- Technical High Schools - duration of education is 4 years (5 years for Anatolian Vocational High Schools including one year in a preparatory class in foreign language);</p> <p>- Vocational and Technical Education Centres - formal and non-formal education institutions established on the basis of a multi-programme under a single management; provide secondary education diplomas or certificates in vocational and technical education;</p> <p>- Dual Vocational and Technical Education Centres – provide qualified technical personnel, experienced apprentices, and trainers for the motor and industrial</p>	<p>- LYCEUMS provide education for pupils aged 14-19 years; offer studies in 6 directions: Art High School ; Classical High School; Scientific Lyceum; Linguistic Lyceum; Choral and music Lyceum; School of Human Sciences.</p> <p>- Professional schools – provide vocational education for pupils aged 14-19 years; offer studies in 2 sectors, service sector (4 branches- agriculture; health and social care; food and wine and hospitality; trade) and industry and handicraft (2 branches- industrial and handicraft productions; maintenance and technical assistance)</p> <p>- Technical schools – provide technical education for pupils aged</p>

<p>primary education or secondary education grade;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Centers for vocational training (CVTs) - provide vocational training of persons aged 16 and over; - Centres for information and vocational orientation - provide vocational orientation of students and other persons; 	<p>electronics sector. The duration of education is three years.</p> <p>One important peculiarity of Turkish VET system is related to the fact, that apart from the “classical” high schools for vocational and vocational-technical education, there are “unique” schools in areas with low and sparse population named “high schools with multiple programmes” – they provide both general and vocational-technical upper secondary education.</p> <p>The secondary education institutions offering vocational and technical training enclose compulsory courses in the 9th grade;</p> <p>The pupils are allocated to branches in the 10th grade and vocational branch in the 11th grade and attend to these branches in the 12th grade and graduate. The branches in vocational and technical education institutions could be classified as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - industrial and technical branches; - branches related to 	<p>14-19 years; offer studies referred to 2 sectors, economic sector (2 branches: administration, finance and marketing; tourism) and technological sector (9 branches - mechanics and energy; transportation and logistics; electronics; ICT; graphics and communication; chemical and biotechnologies; fashion; agriculture; food processing and agro-industry; building and environment);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Vocational training centers - regional; - Training bodies managed by non-profit associations and cooperatives - Apprenticeship
--	--	--

	<p>commerce, tourism and communication;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - branches related to social services; - branches related to religious services. <p>Another peculiarity of Turkish VET system is the dual vocational education - vocational education in schools and in the enterprises (pupils attending to 10th, 11th and 12th grades receive theoretical and practical education in institutions for two days per week and skill training in enterprises for the remaining three days)</p>	
--	---	--

3. Legal approaches to quality assurance in VET

BULGARIA	TURKEY	ITALY
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - lack of legal definition of quality assurance in VET; - lack of special regulation of quality assurance in VET (both at system-level and provider-level); - lack of legal requirements for quality assurance cycle 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - lack of national quality assurance approach - special legal provision for planning, programming, implementing, following and controlling all the educational and training services; - special supervisory bodies to 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -existence of special regulation establishing 2 types of evaluation of educational institutions: - internal evaluation of schools - 3 main areas of quality (teaching, administrative,

<p>(planning-implementation-evaluation-review);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - lack of legal definition of criteria and indicators for quality in VET; there is a list of criteria and indicators for self-assessment of IVET providers (adopted in 2009) - lack of a special institution responsible for quality assurance; - licensing of CVET as a measure for quality assurance for adult training; 	<p>the Ministry of National Education (MoNE) Board of Inspection for evaluation and supervision of VET institutions - Ministerial inspectors at the national and central level (evaluation of secondary VET institutions) and Primary Education Inspectors (evaluation of primary schools) – at the provincial and sub-provincial levels.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - supervision/evaluation procedures established include both VET institutions and personnel (administrators and teachers) - work and operations of the VET institutions, performance of administrators, teachers and the other personnel, teaching, examinations, certification, environmental relations, etc. 	<p>environmental), for each area the indicators of quality are legally defined; encouragement of self-evaluation include feedback-questionnaires for parents, staff and students;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - external evaluation – performed by a special institution responsible for the national evaluation of the Education and Training system; Introduced special system for accreditation of national structures for the quality of services – significant decentralization, as the regions grant accreditation to training agencies for initial, higher, or continuing vocational training
--	--	---

4. Overview of VET teachers/trainers profiles

BULGARIA	TURKEY	ITALY
<p>5 professional levels of teachers:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - junior teacher - teacher - senior teacher - head teacher -specialist in education methodology. <p><u>Mandatory qualification degree for teachers</u> - Bachelor or Master in the relevant professional field and acquired professional qualification of “Teacher”. The qualification “Teacher” may be acquired in the course of studying for Bachelor or Master in higher school or after graduation.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - VET teacher - tutor - coordinator teacher - guidance teachers - specialist and senior educator - technician 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - support teacher - secondary school teacher - professor Vocational Training <p><u>Mandatory qualification degree for teachers</u> for teachers in secondary school of the I and the II grade - Master degree and one year of Internship;</p>

5. Transparency of teachers' qualifications

BULGARIA	TURKEY	ITALY
No public access to information	<p>Existence of administration information system (MEBBIS), providing information for personnel (personal information, merit system, inspection, investigation, supervision), institutions, archive- written records, statistics, norm, procedures, student attendance, etc.</p> <p>Personnel information provided by MEBBIS:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - personal information, - birth certificate information, - position / promotion procedures, - educational information, - credentials, - declaration of property statement, - union relations, - leave of absence, - appointment/change of location, - rewards/penalty, etc. 	No public access to the information that regards teachers' qualification, experience, etc.; such data is protected under the Law of privacy.

6. Approaches for quality assurance of VET: instruments, measures, indicators, criteria for employment as VET, regular tests, etc.

BULGARIA	TURKEY	ITALY
<p>No systematic national approach to QA in VET; lack of officially adopted criteria and indicators for QA;</p> <p>The current measures applied:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - State educational standards for VET – prerequisite for quality of education, as they define the aims and objectives of education, vocational competencies to be achieved and expected results from the education/training ; - List of professions for VET – seen as instrument for linking VET with labor market; - Licensing procedure for the Centers for vocational training and Centers for information and vocational guidance; - Follow-up control of the CVT and CIVG; they are obliged to provide annual information for their activity to the licensing body (NAVET); - A sample framework for self-assessment of vocational high-schools has been developed by 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Internal evaluation at school level (by school administrators); - external evaluation at local and national level (by primary education supervisors at local level and by the Inspectors of the Ministry (Supervisory Board) at central level) - include the supervision of both institutions and personnel; - Supervision of the institutions – includes investigation of work and operations - such as performance of administrators, teachers and the other personnel, teaching, examinations, certification, environmental relations; - Evaluation of student achievement by means of the national and international monitoring studies and research-development studies (conducted or coordinated by Directorate for Research and Development of Education); 	<p>Approaches to QA:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Hetero-evaluation - ISO 9001-2000, the system of accreditation of training bodies (DM 166/2001) and the Model of accreditation ASFOR ; - Self-assessment - the system of indicators OECD-CERI, the CIPP Model, Model Self-Assessment Institute (Trento), the model evaluation of the Shares (ENAIP), the model for self-assessment Isfol structures of schools and training 34; - Mixed system - the EFQM excellence and the Model Campus (CRUI); - Accreditation – obligatory for the training institutions organizing and delivering training activities financed with public

<p>the Ministry of education and science;</p>	<p>- Lack of evaluation system which measures and evaluates the performance of the institution and/or team performances.</p>	<p>resources; Criteria for accreditation: 1. organizational structure and administrative (nature and statutory purpose of the institution, economical and financial situation, minimal requirements for the professional resources, organization of the processes of design, implementation and evaluation of services); 2. logistics (availability and adequacy of local furniture equipment); 3. relations (system of relations on the territory) 4. performance (level of design efficiency; level of neglect; level of training success)</p>
---	--	---

7. Progress in adoption of European Quality Assurance Framework for VET

BULGARIA	TURKEY	ITALY
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Established National Reference Point for quality assurance, but still with low popularity; - Established interdepartmental working group to the Ministry of Education, Youth and Science to elaborate quality assurance measures and actions in VET; - Elaborated special Analysis of the Quality Assurance System in VET in Bulgaria (February 2011); based on this analysis a project for QA system has been elaborated. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - National Reference Point for quality assurance not established yet 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Established National Reference Point for the quality assurance in VET; - Adopted National Plan for quality assurance in Education and Training

8. Identified mismatches, shortages and gaps in quality assurance for VET

BULGARIA	TURKEY	ITALY
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Lack of clear legal prerequisites for development of quality assurance in VET; - Lack of clear vision for quality assurance in VET (no formal definition of quality assurance at all); - Lack of legal regulation of institutions' responsibility regarding quality assurance; - Lack of adopted criteria for QA in VET – both on system-level and on provider-level; - Lack of legally defined set of indicators for quality assessment in VET – both on system-level and on provider-level; - Lack of feedback mechanism in the process of implementation of QA policy; - Clear need for development of guidelines for QA on VET provider level; - Need for explicitly defined responsibilities of VET providers with regard to QA; - Lack of adequate information locally regarding EU policy developments in relation to QA (National reference point 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - VET Policy is conducted at national level (centralized) - No national QA approach exists - National Reference Point for QA not established yet 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Accreditation proves to be a rather weak quality system; - No effective control for the quality of training programs in lifelong learning education; - No specific regulations for identification of the professional resources to be used in LLE (e.g. minimal criteria of qualification); - Indications for poor management culture in organizations of vocational training, weak orientation towards research of new tools that could improve training processes, resources and results.

<p>established, but lack popularity and rather passive role);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Lack of trusted sources of information, surveys and analyses to serve the QA process;		
---	--	--